



Capitalisation of Livestock Programme Experiences India (CALPI)

**Report of the brain storming session on
Veterinary and Animal Husbandry Education**

**New Delhi
February 2003**

Veterinary and Animal Husbandry Education

Report of the Brain storming Session

22 January 2003

Introduction

CALPI has organised a brain storming session on “Formal and Informal Veterinary and Animal Husbandry Education” at New Delhi on 22/01/03. The objective was to establish a discussion platform and to identify a set of crucial issues in Veterinary and Animal Husbandry Education in India. The workshop was moderated by Professor Fritz Schneider of Swiss College of Agriculture and attended by Dr Ramakumar V (Former Secretary, Veterinary Council of India) and representatives from SMILDA, VOTI, G B Pant University, SDC-IC and CALPI (list of participants - Annexure-1).

Background

There is an increasing perception among many stakeholders in the livestock sector that the graduates and paravets are not equipped enough to face the emerging challenges and fast changing needs of the sector. Their main focus appears to be on clinical practice. The graduates are generally believed to have little appreciation of indigenous knowledge, herbal medicine, livestock environmental interactions, participatory techniques, gender balance, farmers’ traditional wisdom etc. Similarly, subjects like disease control and eradication, quarantine and certification, veterinary public health etc. though taught, are not receiving the focus they deserve. The need to establish a well balanced livestock service delivery system through a combination of public and private actors and the efforts to equip them to deliver effective services to the farmers deserves further attention. The purpose of the brain storming session was to facilitate a review of the current veterinary and animal husbandry education so as to, in the long run, fully equip the veterinary graduates and paravets adequately to address the emerging needs of the livestock sector.

The workshop

The workshop followed a defined structure consisting of group discussion and plenary (workshop design - Annexure-2). It started with a brief introduction by Ms Lucy Maarse (Delegate Intercooperation/ Deputy Coordinator, SDC) on the evolution of CALPI programme in the context of the country programme of SDC-IC for India. She also gave an outline of the vision, overall goal, values and guiding principles of SDC. It was followed by two short presentations by Mr Frank Udo Hoeggel (Senior Advisor-NRM) and Dr A K Joseph (CALPI) on the CALPI programme and the concerns of CALPI respectively. The concerns expressed included globalisation and livestock revolution and the consequent need to improve the competitiveness of smallholders in terms of quality, food safety, price and market access. Concerns also included the role definition of public/ private service providers and client orientation of veterinary services in terms of quality, timely delivery and price.

This was followed by a presentation by Professor (Dr) Ramakumar on the problems of veterinary and AH education in India. He listed the main problems as lack of human power (teachers and veterinarians), lack of support supply and maintenance system (SSMS) and deficiency of higher training / HRD programmes for veterinarians.

The introductory session was followed by group work where major issues in livestock service delivery and the important stakeholders involved in the issues are discussed (see Box 1 for the major issues).

Box 1

Major issues in livestock service delivery system (Group 1)
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Low Field Orientation Low Feed back and feed forward (Farmers ↔ DAH ↔ University) More theory, less practicals and field exposure Low thrust on extension (volume and content)• Inmbalanced orientation of curriculum Heavy clinical orientation More Western and less Indian bench marking No standardized training curriculum of para veterinary workers No thrust on livestock-environmental issues Less thrust on preventive health coverage and disease control & eradication• Inadequacy of frame conditions Support Supply and Maintenance System (SSMS) not in place Lack of policies on services Low importance to buffalo and small livestock Minor veterinary services not defined and brought under legal frame (though Veterinary Council has given powers to all states to do this) No clear service definition for para veterinary staff (for this also the Veterinary Council has given powers to all states) More focus on career and less on service
Major issues in livestock service delivery system (Group 2)
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Low sustainability (economic, social, environmental, institutional) of livestock services• Alternate practices and home remedy not put on the curriculum• Gap between perceived and actual demand• Lack of synergy and convergence of services Lack of skills in functioning as a promoter /facilitator /consultant and helping farmers analyse the situation• Lack of clear definition of the role and boundaries of Veterinarians, Para veterinarians and Para veterinary workers

A structured SWOT analysis of the following topics followed this:

- (a) formal veterinary education
- (b) formal para veterinary education and
- (c) informal para veterinary education

For the details of SWOT analysis please see Annexure 3 and 4. The perceived weaknesses identified in formal veterinary education, formal para veterinary education and informal Para veterinary education are given in Table 1.

Table 1: Perceived weaknesses of formal veterinary education, formal para veterinary education and informal para veterinary education

Formal Veterinary Education (1)	Formal para veterinary Education (2)	Informal para veterinary Education (3)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Inadequacy of staff and infrastructure •Low Professional competence of teachers (know-how, delivery) •ICAR pays less attention to vet field •Top down curriculum devpt. •Choice to study vet science not related to interest •Strict compartmentalisation between practising and teaching •Selection of teachers based on academic abilities and not teaching abilities •emphasis is on livestock and not on livestock holders or livelihoods •Low focus on sustainability and environment •Low focus on demands of students •Inadequate updating of skills and knowledge of teachers •Poor analysis & planning of HR requirements •Lack of flexibility .Not synergised with paravet education & training •Competent professionals not opting for teaching •Shortage of practical training •Moulded as service provider and not as enabler 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Lack of role clarity (paravet and paravet workers) •No uniform/ standardised syllabus and duration of courses offered by different institutions •Aimed at delivery of goods only Absence of a reliable data is a major constraint as most inferences are drawn on perception of a few. In the absence of retrievable data, perceptions can not be verified or corrected as the perceptions that count are that of administrators which are not challenged in the system of hierarchy. Therefore perceptions can be subjective and vulnerabl to political pressure 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Lack of role clarity (paravet and paravet workers) •No uniform/ standardised syllabus and duration •No control on quality of services •Low sustainability-donor dependent •No synergy between different agencies •Minimum educational qualification not prescribed

After detailed discussions the workshop suggested the following potential **entry points for CALPI**:

- (1) Consolidate discussion groups (add livestock keepers and farmers' organisations also)
- (2) Establish electronic platform
- (3) Conduct situation/ need analysis/ Inventory of service providers (after compiling earlier works done on the same issue)
- (4) Identify and define areas where CALPI wants to provoke (cases)
- (5) Establish a functional link with Veterinary Council of India (VCI)
- (6) Facilitate definition of minor veterinary services and bring them under legal framework
- (7) Standardise paravet workers' curriculum, training and tasks
- (8) Review curriculum guide
- (9) Experimental curriculum development in other subjects relevant for vets (system thinking, business management etc.)
- (10) Updating vets and paravets to new developments
- (11) Strengthening district veterinary centres
- (12) Support GOI on implementation of information system (National Animal Production and Health Information system – NAPHIS)
- (13) Revolving fund to universities for training
- (14) Consolidate SWOT exercise through wider state level consultations involving SMILDA, VOTI, NDDB etc.

Conclusion

The workshop was essentially a brainstorming attempt to understand the current profile of formal and informal veterinary and animal husbandry education in India. It was concluded that CALPI has a definite role to play as a facilitator to provoke thinking on the desired changes through synergy and convergence of resource (energy, money, human power etc.) and by bringing people concerned and their experiences together. Before starting, CALPI should clarify linkages of “livestock service delivery” thrust and “veterinary education” thrust. Gathering at least some (random) relevant, logical, recordable and retrievable data may be essential. Developing a mechanism for the purpose, maybe, though humble a good beginning.

The **entry points** from 1-7 will be the **first few steps** of CALPI in the order of priority. Apart from these, identification of lacunae in the current livestock service delivery system and linking them with veterinary education was also identified as a very important activity during the initial phase.

The workshop ended with a vote of thanks.

Annexure 1

List of participants

Resource Persons

SDC-IC

CALPI

Dr A K Misra
GB Pant University

Ms Lucy Maarse

Dr A K Joseph

Dr K V K Patnaik
VOTI, Bhubaneswar

Dr K R Viswanathan

Mr Padmakumar V

Dr Ramakumar V
Former Secretary
Indian Veterinary Council

Mr Udo Hoeggel

Prof. Fritz Schneider
(Consultant/ Moderator)

Dr P Venkitramaiah
SMILDA, Hyderabad

Annexure-2
Workshop Design

**CALPI Workshop on
Veterinary and AH Education
22 January 2003**

Objective: To establish a discussion platform
and identify a set of crucial issues
to form entry points for CALPI

Expected Results

- Discussion platform initiated
- Crucial issues identified
- Potential entry points selected
- Next steps agreed upon

Welcome	10.00 Hrs
Introduction	
CALPI Context SDC-IC	10.15 Hrs
CALPI Objectives, Thrusts	
CALPI Concerns	
Input (Dr Ramakumar V)	10.30 Hrs
Present situation of Veterinary services (Group work I)	11.00 Hrs
Lunch break	12.30 Hrs
Structured SWOT Analysis (Group work II)	13.15 Hrs
Potential entry points	14.45 Hrs
Next steps	15.30 Hrs
Closing	16.00 Hrs

Annexure 3
Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats of Formal Veterinary Education

Strengths	Weaknesses	Opportunities	Threats
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Sufficient colleges and universities •Vet. Council of India as regulatory body •Uniformity of curriculum •In some institutions good infrastructure, qualified trainers and in-service/ higher education facilities •Focus on practical aspects, projects, field studies, internship •Composite education (vet science, AH) •Bound by code of ethics •Accountability through external examination •Backed by law •Centrally regulated, uniform yet with flexibility 	<p>Please refer to Column 1 of Table 1</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •PRIs •Theory/practice imbalance •Open market .Animal No. and diversity •Recognition/ validation of IK/ traditional alternatives •Current restructuring of service delivery systems •I.T. development •Presence of NGOs (live labs) •Forward and backward linkage of vet. Institutions •Globalisation & emerging needs •Updating of infrastructure, skill and knowledge •Modernisation of service delivery/ public-pvt delivery •CALPI, VCI •Mobilisation of multiple actors and agencies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Open market •Brain drain to industrial production system • Creeping in of corruptive mechanisms •Over regulation •Perception of vet. services as govt. interventions •Inadequate focus on poor •Rigid mindset of trainers •Lack of proper evaluation system

Annexure 4

Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats of Formal Para Veterinary Education

Strengths	Weaknesses	Opportunities	Threats
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •State subject not Central •Para-vet system produces more para-professionals. So has easy access for livestock owners •Low incubation period 	<p>Please refer to Column 2 of Table 1</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Defining minor veterinary practices (legislation) •Paravets from lower classes (e.g.dalits) have access upwards •Can be updated to current requirement •Upgrading skills and knowledge •Can be made more competitive •Career prospects towards formal vet. education 	

Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats of Informal Para Veterinary Education

Strengths	Weaknesses	Opportunities	Threats
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Clients have easy access •Need based •Flexible •Positive response of trainees •Can prepare more trained people •Can cover more areas 	<p>Please refer to Column 3 of Table 1</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Skill development can contribute to fighting discrimination •Better area coverage •Better speed •Can have multi disciplinary approach •Can spare Govt. resources 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Abuse of drugs •Danger of producing more quacks •Poor results cause loss of farmers' faith •Mushrooming of actors/ agencies/ institutes